

Item No.	Classification:	Date:	Meeting Name:
7.3	OPEN	12 February 2013	Planning Sub-committee B
Report title:	Development Management planning application: Application 12/AP/3692 for: Conservation Area Consent Address: DULWICH COLLEGE, DULWICH COMMON, LONDON, SE21 7LG Proposal: Demolition of existing college science building.		
Ward(s) or groups affected:	College		
From:	Head of Development Management		
Application Start Date 15/11/2012		Application Expiry Date 11/03/2013	

RECOMMENDATION

- 1 That conservation area consent be granted.

BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Site location and description

- 2 Dulwich College occupies a large site bounded by Dulwich Common to the north, College Road to the east, Hunts Slip Road to the south and a railway line and Alleyn Park to the west. The site comprises a number of school buildings located on the eastern side of the site, with the western side used as playing fields.
- 3 The site is within the Dulwich Village Conservation Area (sub-area 1), is designated as Metropolitan Open Land (MOL) and forms part of the suburban density zone. The main college building, the Barry building, is Grade II* listed and the main entrance gate and piers on College Road, the war memorial and the memorial library are grade II listed. Outside the campus but opposite off College Road are the grade II listed 1-6, 9 and 10 Pond Cottages.

Details of proposal

- 4 Conservation area consent is sought for the demolition of the existing science building for the college. This is required in connection with a concurrent planning application for the erection of a new science building in a similar position on the site (reference: 12-AP-3691).
- 5 The existing science block is located on the eastern part of the site fronting College Road, and is located between the Barry building and Blew House, one of the boarding houses for overseas students. It is 2-storeys high and was built in 1952, with a later extension fronting College Road added in the late 50s. The extension to the building is structurally unsound owing to subsidence and is no longer used, and a number of pupils are taught in temporary portacabins located to the south of the science block. The building can only be accessed from the western side and is designed as a U shape comprising two parallel courtyards separated by a service block, and with the

later extension to the east. It measures 8.6m high, 47.9m wide along the College Road frontage and has a maximum depth of 49.4m. It is located 15m from the southern elevation of the Barry Building.

Planning history

- 6 References are made in the submission to the Dulwich College Master Plan, which was completed in October last year and covers the period 2011-2019. This is not a formal planning document nor was it submitted with the application for consideration, but it sets out the College's long-term vision and aspirations for the campus, including the provision of a new science building.
- 7 12-AP-3691 - Demolition of existing college science building and erection of a new part 2, part 3-storey science building and associated landscaping (Use Class D1) (UNDER CONSIDERATION).
- 8 12-AP-0525 - Variation of condition 1 (time limit) of planning permission reference 09-AP-0081 dated 29.04.2009 (for 'Erection of a 2-storey temporary teaching block comprising 6 laboratories with 6 external air-conditioning units to rear elevation and erection of 2.4m high fencing around existing science block) to extend the time period for the temporary classrooms to remain in place from 29th February 2012 to 1st March 2015. Planning permission was GRANTED in April 2012.
- 9 11-AP-1802 - Replace existing timber fence with metal railings and new gates on part frontage to College Road. Planning permission was GRANTED in September 2011.
- 10 10-AP-0225 - Erection of 2-storey extension to east elevation (facing College Road), roof extension, and 3-storey extension to west elevation (facing playing fields) to college science block, following demolition of the existing science block extension (Use Class D1). This application was recommended for approval by officers but was WITHDRAWN from the committee agenda in March 2010, together with the concurrent application for conservation area consent to demolish the existing building (reference:10-AP-0228).
- 11 09-AP-2047 - Erection of 3-storey extension to college science block, following the demolition of the existing extension (Use Class D1). This application for planning permission was WITHDRAWN from the Planning Committee agenda in November 2009 because it was recommended for refusal on the grounds of its design, impact upon the setting of the listed building and the character and appearance of the Dulwich Village Conservation Area.
- 12 09-AP-2049 - Demolition of existing two storey extension to college science block (Use Class D1). This application for conservation area consent was WITHDRAWN from the Planning Committee agenda in November 2009.
- 13 09-AP-0081 - Erection of a 2-storey temporary teaching block comprising 6 laboratories with 6 external air-conditioning units to rear elevation and erection of 2.4m high fencing around existing science block. Planning permission was GRANTED in April 2009.
- 14 07-AP-1198 - Demolition of existing swimming pool, associated changing rooms and maintenance facility followed by construction of a two storey building for new changing rooms, cafe and sixth form study centre constituting phase one of this two phase redevelopment; application includes detailed design of windows and doors and external materials (variation to design of approved scheme 05-AP-2233). Planning permission was GRANTED in August 2007.

- 15 07-AP-0267 - Erection of temporary changing rooms to accommodate pupils and staff whilst the composite block redevelopment is on site, plus temporary access road and footpath. Planning permission GRANTED in August 2007 for a period of 2 years.
- 16 07-AP-0278 - Erection of signage positioned 2m inside existing boundary with Alleyn Park Road and adjacent to existing entry gate. Advertisement consent was REFUSED in April 2007 for the following reason:
- 17 The proposal, by reason of its visually prominent location and the size of the signs, will pose harm to the character and appearance of the Dulwich Village Conservation Area. The proposal is therefore harmful to visual amenity and is contrary to Policies 3.13 Urban Design, 3.15 Conservation of the Historic Environment, 3.16 Conservation Areas, 3.18 Setting of Listed Buildings, Conservation Areas and World Heritage Sites, 3.23 Outdoor Advertising and Signage of the emerging Southwark Unitary Development Plan March 2007 and E.2.3 Aesthetic Control, E.3.1 Protection of Amenity, E.4.3 Proposals Affecting Conservation Areas of the Southwark Unitary Development Plan 1995, 4B1 Design Principles for a Compact City of the London Plan as well as PPG 15 Planning and the Historic Environment, PPG 19 Outdoor Advertising Control, SPG Outdoor Advertising and Signage.
- 18 05-AP-2233 - Demolition of part of the existing music school and college shop and construction of a two storey building comprising new music performance space with teaching, practice and recording spaces plus support facilities including offices, stores and wcs. Planning permission was GRANTED in August 2006. Conservation area consent was GRANTED in November 2006 for demolition of the relevant buildings, which in themselves make no contribution to the character and appearance of the conservation area (reference: 05-AP-2237).
- 19 04-AP-1268 - Demolition of the existing swimming pool complex, changing rooms and maintenance department and construction of a new 2-storey building on the same footprint containing new school accommodation (changing rooms, classrooms, cafe with outdoor courtyard, lecture theatre, new sixth form centre & common room & ancillary accommodation); refurbishment of existing adjacent accommodation/common room and re-roof existing common room and music school. Planning permission was GRANTED in October 2004.

Planning history of adjoining sites

- 20 Given the spaciousness of the college campus, permissions outside of the site have little bearing on this application.

KEY ISSUES FOR CONSIDERATION

Summary of main issues

- 21 The main issue to be considered in respect of this application is:
- a) the impact of the proposal upon the character and appearance of this part of the Dulwich Village Conservation Area.

Planning policy

- 22 Core Strategy 2011
Strategic policy 12 - Design and conservation
- 23 Southwark Plan 2007 (July) - saved policies

3.16 - Conservation areas

Dulwich Village Conservation Area Appraisal (February 2006)

24 London Plan 2011

Policy 7.8 Heritage assets and archaeology

25 National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF)

Section 12 - Conserving and enhancing the historic environment

Impact of the demolition of the building upon the character and appearance of this part of the Dulwich Village Conservation Area.

- 26 Dulwich College campus is characterised by open grounds with a picturesque landscape of mature trees, into which a series of pavilions dating from the mid 19th century through to the early 21st century are set. At the heart of the campus is the North Italian Renaissance styled main college block by Charles Barry Junior (the Barry building). The grade II* listed building dates from the mid 19th century and is composed as a series of three blocks (3 storeys with an attic storey) linked by two arcades. The facades of the building are red brick with honey-toned terracotta embellishments and the roof is a traditional pitched roof covered in clay pan-type tiles; in the centre is a large timber tower with glazed lights. This elegant tower is visible in the short and long views around the environs of the college.
- 27 Saved policy 3.16 of the Southwark Plan 'Conservation areas' states that there is the general presumption in favour of retaining buildings that contribute positively to the character or appearance of the conservation area. Planning permission will not be granted for proposals that involve the demolition or substantial demolition of a building that contributes positively to the character or appearance of the conservation area.
- 28 The existing two storey science block is considered to be a neutral building within the Dulwich Village Conservation Area, and does not contribute to the significance or setting of the grade II* listed Barry building. Where this is the case, paragraph 138 of the NPPF advises that 'the loss of a building (or other element) which makes a positive contribution to the significance of the conservation area... should be treated either as substantial harm under paragraph 133 or less than substantial harm under paragraph 134, as appropriate, taking into account the relative significance of the element affected and its contribution to the significance of the conservation area... as a whole'. As a neutral building its demolition would lead to less than substantial harm and paragraph 134 of the NPPF states that 'where a development proposal will lead to less than substantial harm to the significance of a designated heritage asset, this harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal, including securing its optimum viable use.'
- 29 The College Road wing of the science block is structurally unsound and therefore not currently in use by the school. A detailed structural report has been provided in support of the application which confirms that whilst the original part of the 1950s building is in reasonable condition, the extension towards College Road has suffered from differential settlement. This report was produced before the decision was taken to demolish the existing science block in its entirety and has subsequently been updated through an addendum, but the original report does highlight the need for the remainder of the structure to be significantly strengthened should it be retained and reused.

30 The existing building is un-insulated and at present is only accessible via the main entrance door on the western elevation which results in a bottleneck at busy times. Moreover, the entrance is not DDA compliant and there is no disabled access to the first floor of the building.

31 A concurrent application for a replacement scheme has been submitted and officers are of the view that it would be acceptable. Given that the existing building makes a neutral contribution to the character and appearance of the conservation area, its structural problems and the benefits that the new building would provide in terms of accessibility and quality of teaching space, it is considered that the demolition of the existing building and subsequent redevelopment would comply with saved policy 3.16 of the Southwark Plan and paragraph 134 of the NPPF. To ensure that there would be no harmful gap site within the conservation area, a condition is recommended preventing demolition of the building from taking place until there is a valid contract for the construction of the replacement building.

Other matters

32 There are no other matters arising from the application.

Conclusion

33 In light of the neutral contribution the existing building makes to the character and appearance of the conservation area, its limitations in term of accessibility and structural stability and because a suitable replacement scheme has been put forward, it is recommended that conservation area consent be granted.

Community impact statement

34 In line with the Council's Community Impact Statement the impact of this application has been assessed as part of the application process with regard to local people in respect of their age, disability, faith/religion, gender, race and ethnicity and sexual orientation. Consultation with the community has been undertaken as part of the application process.

a) The impact on local people is set out in the report for the concurrent application for planning permission (12-AP-3691).

b) The following issues relevant to particular communities/groups likely to be affected by the proposal have been identified in the report for the concurrent application for planning permission (12-AP-3691).

c) The likely adverse or less good implications for any particular communities/groups have been also been discussed in the report for the concurrent application for planning permission (12-AP-3691).

Consultations

35 Details of consultation and any re-consultation undertaken in respect of this application are set out in Appendix 1.

Consultation replies

Details of consultation responses received are set out in Appendix 2.

36 Summary of neighbour consultation responses

No representations have been received.

Human rights implications

- 37 This planning application engages certain human rights under the Human Rights Act 2008 (the HRA). The HRA prohibits unlawful interference by public bodies with conventions rights. The term 'engage' simply means that human rights may be affected or relevant.

This application has the legitimate aim of demolishing the existing science building. The rights potentially engaged by this application, including the right to a fair trial and the right to respect for private and family life are not considered to be unlawfully interfered with by this proposal.

BACKGROUND DOCUMENTS

Background Papers	Held At	Contact
Site history file: TP/2084-C Application file: 12/AP/3692 Southwark Local Development Framework and Development Plan Documents	Chief Executive's Department 160 Tooley Street London SE1 2QH	Planning enquiries telephone: 020 7525 5403 Planning enquiries email: planning.enquiries@southwark.gov.uk Case officer telephone: 020 7525 5410 Council website: www.southwark.gov.uk

APPENDICES

No.	Title
Appendix 1	Consultation undertaken
Appendix 2	Consultation responses received
Appendix 3	Recommendation

AUDIT TRAIL

Lead Officer	Gary Rice, Head of Development Management	
Report Author	Victoria Lewis, Senior Planning Officer	
Version	Final	
Dated	25 January 2013	
Key Decision	No	
CONSULTATION WITH OTHER OFFICERS / DIRECTORATES / CABINET MEMBER		
Officer Title	Comments Sought	Comments included
Strategic Director of Finance & Corporate Services	No	No
Strategic Director, Environment and Leisure	No	No
Strategic Director, Housing and Community Services	No	No
Director of Regeneration	No	No
Date final report sent to Constitutional Team		31 January 2013

APPENDIX 1

Consultation undertaken

38 **Site notice date:** 30/11/2012

Press notice date: 29/11/2012

Case officer site visit date: 30/11/2012

Neighbour consultation letters sent: 27/11/2012

Internal services consulted: None

Statutory and non-statutory organisations consulted:

39 English Heritage
Council for British Archaeology

Neighbours and local groups consulted:

Date Printed	Address
27/11/2012	107 ALLEYN PARK LONDON SE21 8AA
27/11/2012	105 ALLEYN PARK LONDON SE21 8AA
27/11/2012	103 ALLEYN PARK LONDON SE21 8AA
27/11/2012	109 ALLEYN PARK LONDON SE21 8AA
27/11/2012	117 ALLEYN PARK LONDON SE21 8AA
27/11/2012	115 ALLEYN PARK LONDON SE21 8AA
27/11/2012	111 ALLEYN PARK LONDON SE21 8AA
27/11/2012	101 ALLEYN PARK LONDON SE21 8AA
27/11/2012	FLAT 2 THE CHESTNUTS DULWICH COMMON LONDON SE21 7EW
27/11/2012	1 HUNTS SLIP ROAD LONDON SE21 7LJ
27/11/2012	4 GALLERY ROAD LONDON SE21 7AB
27/11/2012	FLAT 3 THE CHESTNUTS DULWICH COMMON LONDON SE21 7EW
27/11/2012	FLAT 6 THE CHESTNUTS DULWICH COMMON LONDON SE21 7EW
27/11/2012	FLAT 5 THE CHESTNUTS DULWICH COMMON LONDON SE21 7EW
27/11/2012	FLAT 4 THE CHESTNUTS DULWICH COMMON LONDON SE21 7EW
27/11/2012	113 ALLEYN PARK LONDON SE21 8AA
27/11/2012	99 ALLEYN PARK LONDON SE21 8AA
27/11/2012	97 ALLEYN PARK LONDON SE21 8AA
27/11/2012	THE CHESTNUTS DULWICH COMMON LONDON SE21 7EW
27/11/2012	PORTERS FLAT DULWICH COLLEGE DULWICH COMMON LONDON SE21 7LG
27/11/2012	MEDICAL CENTRE DULWICH COLLEGE COLLEGE ROAD LONDON SE21 7LG
27/11/2012	95 ALLEYN PARK LONDON SE21 8AA
27/11/2012	123 ALLEYN PARK LONDON SE21 8AA
27/11/2012	121 ALLEYN PARK LONDON SE21 8AA
27/11/2012	119 ALLEYN PARK LONDON SE21 8AA
27/11/2012	83 ALLEYN PARK LONDON SE21 8AA
27/11/2012	93 ALLEYN PARK LONDON SE21 8AA
27/11/2012	87 ALLEYN PARK LONDON SE21 8AA
27/11/2012	85 ALLEYN PARK LONDON SE21 8AA
27/11/2012	6 GALLERY ROAD LONDON SE21 7AB
27/11/2012	1A ALLISON GROVE LONDON SE21 7ER
27/11/2012	48A COLLEGE ROAD LONDON SE21 7BA
27/11/2012	9 TOLLGATE DRIVE LONDON SE21 7LS
27/11/2012	1B ALLISON GROVE LONDON SE21 7ER
27/11/2012	ELM LAWN DULWICH COMMON LONDON SE21 7EW
27/11/2012	IVYHOLM COLLEGE ROAD LONDON SE21 7LG
27/11/2012	NORTHCROFT DULWICH COMMON LONDON SE21 7EW
27/11/2012	10 TOLLGATE DRIVE LONDON SE21 7LS
27/11/2012	THE OLD SANATORIUM HUNTS SLIP ROAD LONDON SE21 7LJ
27/11/2012	OLD BLEW HOUSE DULWICH COMMON LONDON SE21 7EW
27/11/2012	DULWICH COLLEGE DULWICH COMMON LONDON SE21 7LG
27/11/2012	53 COLLEGE ROAD LONDON SE21 7LF

27/11/2012 51 COLLEGE ROAD LONDON SE21 7LF
27/11/2012 41 COLLEGE ROAD LONDON SE21 7BA
27/11/2012 7 POND COTTAGES COLLEGE ROAD LONDON SE21 7LE
27/11/2012 6 POND COTTAGES COLLEGE ROAD LONDON SE21 7LE
27/11/2012 5 POND COTTAGES COLLEGE ROAD LONDON SE21 7LE
27/11/2012 8 POND COTTAGES COLLEGE ROAD LONDON SE21 7LE
27/11/2012 2 GALLERY ROAD LONDON SE21 7AB
27/11/2012 10 POND COTTAGES COLLEGE ROAD LONDON SE21 7LE
27/11/2012 9 POND COTTAGES COLLEGE ROAD LONDON SE21 7LE
27/11/2012 4 POND COTTAGES COLLEGE ROAD LONDON SE21 7LE
27/11/2012 FLAT 1 THE CHESTNUTS DULWICH COMMON LONDON SE21 7EW
27/11/2012 BLEW HOUSE COLLEGE ROAD LONDON SE21 7LG
27/11/2012 TIVERTON LODGE DULWICH COMMON LONDON SE21 7EW
27/11/2012 THE ORCHARD DULWICH COMMON LONDON SE21 7EW
27/11/2012 3 POND COTTAGES COLLEGE ROAD LONDON SE21 7LE
27/11/2012 1 POND COTTAGES COLLEGE ROAD LONDON SE21 7LE
27/11/2012 THE WILLOWS DULWICH COMMON LONDON SE21 7EW
27/11/2012 TULSI DULWICH COMMON LONDON SE21 7ES

Re-consultation: Not required.

APPENDIX 2

Consultation responses received

Internal services N/A.

Statutory and non-statutory organisations

40 English Heritage

No response received at the time of writing, but the response for the concurrent planning application is as follows:

'This application should be determined in accordance with national and local policy guidance and on the basis of your specialist conservation advice'. (reference: 12-AP-3691).

41 Council for British Archaeology

No response received at the time of writing

42 **Neighbours and local groups** No representations have been received.